

# International Journal of Philosophical Studies

The *International Journal of Philosophical Studies* publishes academic articles of the highest quality from both analytic and continental traditions and provides a forum for publishing on a broader range of issues than is currently available in philosophical journals. *IJPS* also publishes annual special issues devoted to key thematic areas or to critical engagements with contemporary philosophers of note.

Through its Discussion section, it provides a lively forum for exchange of ideas and encourages dialogue and mutual comprehension across all philosophical traditions. The journal also contains an extensive book review section, including occasional book symposia. It also provides Critical Notices which review major books or themes in depth. The broad range of *IJPS* makes it essential reading for professionals in all fields of philosophy, for graduate students and for all those who take an interest in philosophical questions and their historical development.

Review copies to Dr James R. O'Shea, School of Philosophy, University College Dublin,  
Dublin 4, Ireland. E-mail: Jim.Oshea@ucd.ie

*International Journal of Philosophical Studies* is a peer-reviewed journal published five times a year by Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group Ltd. Registered office: 4 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, OX14 4RN, UK. Tel: +44 (0)207 017 6000 Fax: +44 (0)207 017 6336

Web site: <http://www.tandf.co.uk>

Issues of *IJPS* are available to institutional subscribers via the World Wide Web.

Subscription rates for Vol. 19, 2011 (five issues)

UK Institutional £549 Personal £119  
Europe Institutional €727 Personal €158  
Rest of World Institutional US\$913 Personal US\$199  
Online Only (plus tax where applicable) £494 €654 US\$822

*International Journal of Philosophical Studies* (USPS permit number 020 149) is published five times a year in February, May, July, October and December. The 2011 US institutional subscription price is US\$913. For a list of countries in which the Euro rate applies or if you are unsure which rate applies to you please contact Customer Services in the UK. Periodicals postage paid at Jamaica, NY, and additional mailing offices. **US Postmaster:** Please send address changes to *IJPS*, c/o Olywisy Press, Inc. PC Box 7307, Gonic NH 03839. Address Service Requested.

Subscriptions purchased at the personal rate are strictly for personal, non-commercial use only. The resulting of personal subscriptions is prohibited. Personal subscriptions must be purchased with a personal cheque or credit card. Proof of personal status may be requested.

Taylor & Francis has a flexible approach to subscriptions enabling us to match individual libraries' requirements. This journal is available via a traditional institutional subscription (either print with online access, or online only at a discount)

**Ordering information:** USA/Canada/Mexico: Routledge Journals, Taylor & Francis Inc., Journals Department, 325 Chestnut Street, 8th Floor, Philadelphia, PA 19106, USA. **UK/Europe/Rest of World:** T&F Customer Services, T&F Informa UK Ltd, Sheepen Place, Colchester, Essex, CO3 3LP, UK. Email: [subscriptions@tandf.co.uk](mailto:subscriptions@tandf.co.uk)

Copyright © 2011 Taylor & Francis. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored, transmitted, or disseminated, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Taylor & Francis, to whom all requests to reproduce copyright material should be directed, in writing.

Taylor & Francis grants authorization for individuals to photocopy copyright material for private research use, on the sole basis that requests for such use are referred directly to the requestor's local Reproduction Rights Organization (RRO). The copyright fee is £21/US\$34/€26 exclusive of any fee or charge levied. In order to contact your local RRO, please consult: International Federation of Reproduction Rights Organizations' (IFRRO), rue du Prince Royal, 87, B-1050 Brussels, Belgium, email: [ifrrro@skynet.be](mailto:ifrrro@skynet.be); Copyright Clearance Center Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA; email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com); Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London, W1P 0LP, UK; email: [cla@cla.co.uk](mailto:cla@cla.co.uk)

This authorization does not extend to any kind of copying, by any means, in any form, and for any purpose other than private research use.

It is a condition of publication that authors assign copyright or license the publication rights in their articles, including abstracts, to Taylor & Francis (or society name). This enables us to ensure full copyright protection and to disseminate the article, and of course the Journal, to the widest possible readership in print and electronic formats as appropriate. Authors retain many rights under the Taylor & Francis rights policies, which can be found at [www.informaworld.com/authors\\_journals\\_copyright\\_position](http://www.informaworld.com/authors_journals_copyright_position). Authors are themselves responsible for obtaining permission to reproduce copyright material from other sources.

Members of the European Society for Analytical Philosophy (ESAP), the American Catholic Philosophical Association, the North American Kant Society, the North American

# International Journal of Philosophical Studies

Volume 19 Number 3  
July 2011

SPECIAL ISSUE

Kant and Nonconceptual Content  
Guest editor: Dietmar H. Heidemann

Editor: Maria Baghramian

 **Routledge**  
Taylor & Francis Group

# International Journal of Philosophical Studies

Founding Editor: Dermot Moran

Editor: Maria Baghramian

Reviews Editor: James R. O'Shea

Editorial Assistants: Margaret Brady and Luna Dolezal

## Editorial Board

Karl-Otto Apel (Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität, Frankfurt, Germany)

Jonathan Barnes (Université de Paris IV – Sorbonne, France)

Werner Beierwaltes (Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität, München, Germany)

Seyla Benhabib (Yale University, New Haven, USA)

David Chalmers (Australian National University, Canberra, Australia)

Maeve Cooke (Cambridge University, UK)

Tim Crane (University College London, UK)

John Dillon (Trinity College Dublin, Ireland)

Hubert Dreyfus (University of California, Berkeley, USA)

Miranda Fricker (Birkbeck, University of London, UK)

Karsten Harries (Yale University, New Haven, USA)

Klaus Held (Bergische Universität GH, Wuppertal, Germany)

Klaus Jacobi (Albert-Ludwigs-Universität, Freiburg, Germany)

Richard Kearney (University College Dublin, Ireland/  
Boston College, USA)

Ernest Lepore (Rutgers, New Jersey, USA)

Cynthia Macdonald (Queen's University Belfast, UK)

Jeff Malpas (University of Tasmania, Australia)

Thomas McCarthy (Yale University, New Haven, USA)

Kevin Mulligan (Université de Genève, Switzerland)

Philip Pettit (Princeton University, New Jersey, USA)

Otto Pöggeler (Ruhr-Universität, Bochum, Germany)

Peter Simons (Trinity College Dublin, Ireland)

Richard Sorabji (King's College, London, UK)

Rowland Stout (University College Dublin, Ireland)

Charles Taylor (McGill University, Montreal, Canada)

Gianni Vattimo (University of Turin, Italy)

Timothy Williamson (University of Oxford, UK)

Jonathan Wolff (University College London, UK)

Dan Zahavi (University of Copenhagen, Denmark)

## Contents

### SPECIAL ISSUE

Kant and Nonconceptual Content

Dietmar H. Heidemann (Guest Editor)

Introduction: Kant and Nonconceptual Content – Preliminary Remarks 319

### ARTICLES

1. Robert Hanna (*University of Colorado at Boulder, USA*)  
Beyond the Myth of the Myth: A Kantian Theory of  
Non-Conceptual Content 323

2. Robert Hanna (*University of Colorado at Boulder, USA*)  
Kant's Non-Conceptualism, Rogue Objects, and The Gap in  
the B Deduction 399

3. Brady Bowman (*The Pennsylvania State University, USA*)  
A Conceptualist Reply to Hanna's Kantian Non-  
Conceptualism 417

4. Terry F. Godlove, Jr. (*Hofstra University, USA*)  
Hanna, Kantian Non-Conceptualism, and Benacerraf's  
Dilemma 447

5. Stefanie Grüne (*Universität Potsdam, Germany*)  
Is there a Gap in Kant's B Deduction? 465

6. Tobias Schlicht (*Ruhr-Universität Bochum, Germany*)  
Non-Conceptual Content and the Subjectivity of  
Consciousness 491